Annotated Bibliography on Spiritual Formation in the Seminary Jason Ferenczi and Scott Cunningham, August 2009

Asian Consultation on Spiritual Formation in Theological Education: April 25-30, 1988. *Ministerial Formation*, 42, 32-33.

Similar to other consultations on the subject in both the evangelical and ecumenical worlds, this consultation in Yogyakarta, Indonesia, called for holism and integration in the formation of Christian leaders. Achievement of this depends not just on a program of "spiritual exercises," but on the infusion of the entire curriculum with such a spirit of formation.

- Amirtham, S. and R. Pryor (eds.). (n.d.) *The invitation to the feast of life: Resources fro spiritual formation in theological education*. Geneva: World Council of Churches.
- Astly, Jeff, Leslie Francis and Colin Crowder. (1996). *Theological perspectives on Christian formation: A reader on theology and Christian education*. Grand Rapids: William B. Erdmans Publishing Co.
- Banks, Robert. (1999). Rethinking personal and communal formation. Chapter in *Reenvisioning theological education*. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co.
- Barrigar, Chris. (2007). Whither academics? Wither academics? In *Educating for tomorrow: Theological leadership for the Asian context* edited by Manfred Kohl and A. N. Lal Senanayake, expanded edition. Bangalore, India: SAIACS Press.
- Bongmba, E.K. (2001). Spiritual Development, Its Thought, Public Praxis and The Crisis of Intersubjectivity: Refocusing Religious and Theological Thought in Africa. *Religion and Theology*, 8/1,138-164.

Bongmba, a Nigerian, looks at the task of "spiritual development" within the African context. He analyzes a number of recent works by both Africans and Europeans/North Americans on African theology and religion. He posits a "crisis of intersubjectivity," meaning the interactions of people within community, as the fundamental problem of contemporary Africa and the major challenge for theologians and those involved in theological education.

Bongmba's work is especially relevant to theological educators in Africa. His "crisis of intersubjectivity" raises many questions about how to better form leaders and lay people to relate to one another in communities. He sees education and theological reflection as critical to overcoming challenges of contemporary Africa.

Beaudoin, T. (1998). *Virtual faith: The irreverent spiritual quest of Generation X.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Beaudoin critiques the frequently posited idea that "Generation X" is disinterested in spiritual things. Drawing heavily on forms of popular culture in the 1990s, he demonstrates that in fact young people are pursuing profoundly spiritual questions. Although this spiritual seeking may be at times irreverent, it presents a broad window for communicating the Gospel in a way that was much more difficult a generation earlier.

This work presents those considering spiritual formation of those born after the mid 1960s with both an opportunity and a challenge. Beaudoin demonstrates a nearly insatiable hunger for formation. He also shows the unwillingness of members of this generation to accept some traditional answers to spiritual questions. More than it provides answers, this work raises important questions for thinking about spiritual formation of young adults in the North American context.

- Belfast Bible College. (2005). Handbook for spiritual formation. Accessed at www.belfastbiblecollege.com/files/HandbookforSpiritualFormation2005.pdf.
- Bonhoeffer, Dietrich. (1954). Life Together. NY: Harper and Row.

An inspiring account of fellowship among Bonhoeffer and his students in his underground seminary in Nazi Germany. It contains practical advice on life in community and personal spiritual growth in the context of a learning and ministering community.

- Botton, Ken, Chuck King and Junias Venegopal. (1997). Educating for Spirituality. *Christian Education Journal* 1NS, pp. 33-48.
- Buconyori, Elie A. (1993). Educating for spiritual formation. In *Perspectives on leadership training* edited by V. B. Cole, R. F. Gaskin, and R. J. Sim. Nairobi: NEGST.
- Card, Michael. (2008). Student development/spiritual formation. Workshop given at February 2008 Association for Biblical Higher Education Conference. Available for \$5 as MP3 at http://www.soundword.com/cardmichael1.html
- Cetuk, Virginia Samuel. (1998). What to expect in seminary: Theological education as spiritual formation. Nashville: Abingdon.
- Cheesman, Graham. Spiritual formation as a goal of theological education. Unpublished article available online at http://www.theologicaleducation.org/docs/resource2.pdf
- Chickering, Arthur W., Jon C. Dalton, and Liesa Stamm. (2005). *Encouraging authenticity and spirituality in higher education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.

- Chilver, Alan. (1999). "Spiritual formation in the theological college." *Africa Journal of Evangelical Theology*, 18.2, 129-41.
- Chow, W. (1995). "An Integrated Approach to Theological Education." *Evangelical Review of Theology*, 19, 220-227.

Chow, former Principal of China Graduate School of Theology in Hong Kong, addresses the question of the place of spiritual formation in the curriculum. He argues that spiritual formation must not be seen as a separate entity, but as an integral part of all aspects of curriculum.

This "integrative" approach seems to resonate with a number of contemporary discussions of the place of spiritual formation. It is a useful point of view, drawn from another geographic point.

- Clemmons, William. (2004). Spiritual formation in seminary education. *Review and Expositor*, 101.1, 41-66.
- Coe, John. (2000). Intentional Spiritual Formation in the Classroom: Making space for the Spirit in the university. *Christian Education Journal* 4NS.2: 85- [Available online for \$5 at http://wisdom.biola.edu/cej//article/?a=211]
- Coe, John. (2007). The spiritual-epistemological disciplines for studying/doing theology in obedience. Unpublished paper.
- Cramer, Rick. (2008). Quantifying spiritual formation data. Workshop given at February 2008 Association for Biblical Higher Education Conference. Available for \$5 as MP3 at http://www.soundword.com/cramerrick.html
- Cunningham, Shelly. (1998). Who's mentoring the mentors? The discipling dimension of faculty development in Christian higher education. *Theological Education* 34.2, 31-49.
- David, Jeff. (2008). The formation of godly leaders: The application of virtue ethics to the program of the Universidad Cristiana Internacional ESEPA San Jose, Costa Rica. Unpublished D.Min. thesis presented to Gordon-Conwell Theological Seminary.
- Devasahayam, V. (1988). Spiritual formation in theological education from the point of practice in ministry. *Ministerial Formation*, 46, 7-11.

Writing from a theologically liberal perspective, Rev. Devasahayam nonetheless raises many points relevant to spiritual formation in evangelical theological education. Along with a number of other authors, he contrasts the experience of Indian Protestant theological education with that of Hindu *Ashrams*, and concludes that traditional theological training/leadership formation is become nearly totally

irrelevant. He calls for a holistic and contextualized formation of leaders that focuses on learning as a life-long process.

While some of his theological presuppositions are not acceptable, this article and some other parallel literature from South Asia raise important questions about properly forming leaders for ministry in contexts of abject poverty and influence of non-Christian religions. His calls for formation to take place in a life-long, community-oriented context are very relevant to the evangelical task as well.

Driver, J. (1988). Spirituality and theological education. *Ministerial Formation*, 46, 12-25.

Driver, a Paraguayan, presents a compelling and relevant case for proper leadership formation within the context of liberation theology. He rejects both the traditional focus on faith alone and the liberationist focus on works. He critiques colleagues who focus solely on the humanity of Christ and calls for a new focus on active spirituality.

Though dated, this work constitutes an important thread in the rich conversation on spiritual formation in Latin America. He seeks a biblical model that calls for both spiritual depth and social activity rooted in the cross of Christ.

Dykstra, C. and Parks, S. (Eds.) (1986). *Faith development and Fowler*. Birmingham, AL: Religious Education Press.

In this collection of essays, a number of religious educators interact with Fowler and his Stages of Faith theory. The book begins with a summary presentation of Fowler's theory from an updated 1980 article, followed by a series of critical interactions. Dykstra's own is especially provocative, questioning the validity of Fowler's definition of faith as a "human universal." Dykstra, rather, sees faith not as a universal, but as a response to the divine, or as "appropriate and intentional participation in the redemptive activity of God." Most works approach Fowler from a more theological perspective, rather than a human development perspective.

This is a useful collection that gives shape and form to some of my own felt but unarticulated misgivings about Fowler. I especially appreciate Dykstra's more reformed view on the subject and the insertion of a theological framework. None of these works disregards Fowler. His work remains at the center. However, they add to and enhance the work from differing perspectives.

Edwards Jr., Tilden H. (1980). Spiritual formation in theological schools: Ferment and challenge. *Theological Education* 17.1, 7-52.

Ekpunobi, Emmanuel (2005). How can the spiritual development of the student be best encouraged in a theological school? Available online at http://www.theologicaleducation.org/docs/SpirDevTE.pdf

Enns, M. (1999). *Daniel S. Schipani: A challenging Christian religious educator*. Unpublished Manuscript. Deerfield, IL, Trinity Evangelical Divinity School.

Enns examines the life and work of Daniel Schipani, an Anabaptist theologian who ministered and taught in both North and South America. An Argentinian by birth, Schipani was well versed and wrote widely on liberation theology. He was also intimately involved in many pedagogical discussions in Latin America, including the work of Brazilian Paulo Freire. Enns focuses on Schipani's application of Freire's "conscientization" to Christian education. She brings to bear the work of another Argentinian, René Padilla, seeking a balance between spirituality and social action.

Enns' work provides a useful overview of some of the trends in discussions of formation in Christian education in Latin America, giving outline to the key ideas of Freire, Schipani and Padilla. This context can contribute much to a deeper understanding of spiritual formation. Deeply influenced by liberation theology's call for social action, Schipani and Padilla sought, in different ways, to ground such action in the divine Christ while preserving the focus on social engagement.

Fortosis, S. (2001). Theological foundations for a stage model of spiritual formation. *Religious Education*, *96*, 49-63.

Drawing on the works of Fowler and a number of others, Fortosis proposes eight points of tension in spiritual formation (for example, the tension between and movement from dualistic moral outlook to universalized outlook). He argues that the overall goal should be raising of leaders who demonstrate formative integration, responsible consistency and self-transcendent wholeness. He examines this within the scriptural context of the life of Peter.

Although many of the idea are similar to Fowler and others, the examination of these tensions within the life of Peter was cause for further biblical reflection. Fortosis gave sound voice to a trend visible elsewhere stressing wholeness and integration.

Fowler, J.W. (1981). Stages of faith: The psychology of human development and the quest for meaning. New York: Harper & Row.

Drawing richly on the field of psychology, especially the work of B.F. Skinner, Lawrence Kohlberg and Jean Piaget, Fowler posits a theory of stages of faith within human development. After a rich journey through the psychological antecedents of his theory, Fowler describes each of his stages in depth, ranging from early childhood to various stages of adult faith, with rich examples. Overall, his stages lead to increasing levels of self-transcendence.

Fowler's work presents an appropriate background and theoretical model for discussion of spiritual formation. His upper stages present a challenge to the

educator, underscoring that the teacher is also an active participation in progression through stages of faith, always with additional room for growth.

Freeman, Forster. (1987). Spiritual direction for seminarians. *Theological Education* Autumn, 44-56.

Freeman responds to the observation of one study that recent seminary graduates experience a decline in spiritual awareness. His hypothesis, affirmed through a DMin project, is that "students in Protestant seminaries would benefit more from their education for service in the church and world when that training included specific assistance with their personal spiritual formation."

- Galindo, Israel. (2001). "Methods of Christian Education Towards Christian Spirtiual Formation. *Review and Expositor*, 411-29.-
- Gangel, Jeff. (2008). Fostering spirituality formational committees through small groups. Workshop given at February 2008 Association for Biblical Higher Education Conference. Available for \$5 as MP3 at http://www.soundword.com/gnegeljeff.html
- Garber, S. (1996). The fabric of faithfulness: Weaving together belief and behavior during the university years. Downers Grove, IL: Intervarsity.

Garber draws on twenty years of experience teaching college students to analyze what he sees as a critical period of development when some students succeed in a firm integration of their faith with their daily life, while others begin the process of abandoning or compartmentalizing their faith. Garber traces his understanding of the process, drawing on history, literature, theology, sociology and psychology. He analyzes a number of students who ended up in different places of spiritual maturity, seeking to define ways that allowed some to be more successfully integrative.

This is an exciting book that has had broad influence in hundreds of young lives (even if not all know of its influence on their teachers). While anecdotally strong, it does not seem that the case studies stand up to rigorous analysis. Regardless, it raises significant questions of the role and means of spiritual formation during a critical period in human development.

Gilpin, W. Clark. (1988). Theological education as the formation of character. *Theological Education* 24.3: 5-9.

This article forms the editorial introduction to a supplement to *Theological Education* on the topic based on a 1987 ATS seminar. "Traditional assumptions about the communal context of personal character formation [in the seminary] have been upset, then, by at least three factors: the plurality of communities and values, the individualistic current in American religious life, and the formative power of unobserved or unacknowledged norms."

- Herrick, J. (2003). The making of the new spirituality: The eclipse of the Western religious tradition. Downers Grove, IL: Intervarsity Press.
 - Herrick asserts that a traditional understanding of spirituality "revealed word" has been surpassed by a new spirituality. While one can agree with his basic point that there is much of concern in the "new spirituality," the work as a whole is of questionable value. In his attempt to support his thesis, he draws from a variety of sources, both academic and pop cultural, to demonstrate the incursion of a new spirituality. His treatment of Mme. Blavatsky, Rudolf Steiner and theosophy is especially troubling. It is also interesting how he treats German higher criticism of the nineteenth century in the same pages as the "Bible Code" movement of the 1990s. While interesting, it lacks historical continuity.
- Herring, R.. (1999). *Spiritual formation at six Thai evangelical theological institutions*. Columbia, SC: A dissertation project submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree Doctor of Ministry, Columbia International University.
- Herring, Richard and Fritz Deininger. (2007). The challenges and blessings of spiritual formation in theological education. In *Educating for tomorrow: Theological leadership for the Asian context* edited by Manfred Kohl and A. N. Lal Senanayake, expanded edition. Bangalore, India: SAIACS Press.
- Johnson, Susanne. (1989). *Christian spiritual formation in the church and classroom*. Nashville: Abingdon Press.
- Jones, Alan. (1987). Are we lovers anymore? (Spiritual formation in seminaries). *Theological Education*, Autumn, 9-29.
- Jones, L. Gregory. (2002). Beliefs, desires, practices, and the ends of theological education. In *Practicing theology: Beliefs and practices in Christian life*, ed. Miroslav Volf and Dorothy C. Bass. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans.
- Jones, L. Gregory and Stephanie Paulsell (eds.). (2002). *The scope of our art: The vocation of the theological teacher*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans Publishing Co.
- Kang, S. Steve. (2004). The formation process in a learning community. In *A many colored kingdom: Multicultural dynamics for spiritual formation* by Elizabeth Conde-Frazier, S. Steve Kang, and Gary A. Parrett. Pp. 151-66. Grand Rapids: Baker Academic.
 - Teacher and student as fellow learners, teacher as model and friend, enabler, innovator, questioner.
- Kretzschmar, L. (2002). Authentic Christian leadership and spiritual formation in Africa. *Journal of Theology for Southern Africa*, 113, 41-60.

After a brief survey of the literature on leadership in the African tradition, in which he refutes the idea that all models are authoritarian, Kretzschmar analyzes the impact of colonialism and Apartheid on African leadership practice. He calls for a new kind of spiritual formation as part of theological education to form leaders able to live in community and develop whole persons within communities. He draws heavily on the work of Paulo Freire.

This is a well-written and valuable overview of many key issues of leadership in Africa. Many of his prescriptions for theological education parallel those presented in other places, yet are framed within the African context. He calls for both academic rigor and spiritual formation.

- Liefeld, Walter L. and Linda M. Cannell. (1991). The contemporary context of theological education: A consideration of the multiple demands on theological educators. *Crux* 27, 4 (December): 19-27.
- Liefeld, Walter L. and Linda M. Cannell. (1992). Spiritual formation and theological education. In *Alive to God: Studies in spirituality presented to James Houston*. Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press.

An excellent introductory article on the subject of the title, briefly ranging from need to concept to history to program. Though the article is somewhat dated, and therefore some of the issues addressed are given emphasis more appropriate to the debates in the Association of Theological School circles current in the early 1990s, there is still much value in their observations and recommendations for evangelical seminaries.

- Lindbeck, George. (1988). Spiritual formation and theological education. *Theological Education* 24 (Supplement): 10-32. Also (1996). In *Theological perspectives on Christian formation: A reader on theology and Christian education*, ed. Jeff Astley, Leslie Francis, and Colin Crowder. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans.
- Lyke, Alan. (2008). Soul space: fostering the spiritual well-being of online students. Workshop given at February 2008 Association for Biblical Higher Education Conference. Available for \$5 as MP3 at http://www.soundword.com/lykealan.html
- Nicholls, Bruce. (1994). The role of spiritual development in theological education. In *Evangelical Theological Education: An International Agenda. Part 2: Agenda for Renewal*. Edited by Paul Bowers. Nairobi: Evangel. Pp 13-25.
- Nouwen, Henri J. M. (1975). Reaching Out. London: HarperCollins Publishers.

Nouwen, a Catholic, is one of the more important writers on Christian spirituality in the twentieth century. He describes three movements which constitute spiritual growth: the movement from loneliness to solitude (reaching out to our innermost self); from hostility to hospitality (to our fellow human beings); and from illusion to prayer (to our God). The basis of this book was a seminar conducted while Nouwen

- taught at Yale Divinity School, and hence there are a good number of illustrations and applications focused on the seminary context.
- Ochola, John N. (1988). An integrated approach to residential theological education in Africa. *East Africa Journal of Evangelical Theology*, 7.2, 19-22.
- Panotto, N. (2006). *Teología y educación: un abordaje hermenéutico*. Buenos Aires: Fundación Kairós. Retrieved June 19, 2007, from www.kairos.org.ar.

Panotto outlines some challenges for educators and especially theological educators in the Latin American context. He posits that theology and theological education respond to tenets of faith that are expressed within an historical context. Drawing on the work of Paulo Freire and other Latin American educators and theologians, he argues that theological education must place more focus on interpreting the historical context of ideas and utilizing educational processes that draw in both educators and students as active participants, maximizing the experiences and potential of all.

This article is useful in this context for several reasons. First, the stress upon a collaborative, context-oriented learning environment demands that all participants pursue continuing spiritual formation and growth. The educational system he describes includes a deepening understanding of one's faith in context as well as one's own potential for ministry and mission within the social context. The strong emphasis on learner participation presents special opportunities and challenges for seminaries, who bring together students of diverse background, age, spiritual maturity and ministry experience.

- Pazmiño, Robert W. (1994). Nurturing the spiritual lives of teachers. In *The Christian educator's handbook on spiritual formation*. Edited by James C. Wilhoit and Kenneth Gangel. Grand Rapids: Baker Books. Pp. 143-153.
- Peterson, Eugene. (1997). The seminary as a place of spiritual formation. In *Subversive spirituality*. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co. Pp. 54-60.

For Peterson, the seminary is no more or no less a nurturing environment for spirituality than any other place. The seminary is a world of words, but sometimes the words about God upstage the divine Word. Using the approach of Evagrius Ponticus, Peterson writes that seminarians need to take captive every word about God and bring it before the living God in prayerful obedience.

- Pilipino, Pagkataong. (2007). Explorations in an inculturated approach to Christian spiritual formation. In *Educating for tomorrow: Theological leadership for the Asian context* edited by Manfred Kohl and A. N. Lal Senanayake, expanded edition. Bangalore, India: SAIACS Press.
- Reisz, Jr., H. Frederick. (2003) Assessing spiritual formation in Christian seminary communities. *Theological Education*, 39:2, 29-40.

Reisz seeks to define ways of assessing the presence and promise of spiritual formation in a North American seminary context. His key question is, Does the intention have a "defining core" and sufficient intentionality to become a "communal" enterprise, infusing all aspects of the seminary? He develops a useful list of possible measurement tools.

While an admirable attempt, the list presents targets that are quite difficult to measure. He raises some critical question about family life on a seminary campus that could spark further thought. This could serve as a challenge for further work in the North American context and beyond.

Robson, Jill; David Lonsdale (eds.). (1987). *Can spirituality be taught?* London: Association of Centres of Adult Theological Education.

"Rule of St. Benedict," (n.d.). Accessed at http://www.ccel.org/ccel/benedict/rule2/files/rule2.html

These precepts were written by St Benedict, the founder of Western monasticism, for communities of monks living under the direction of an abbot. Its popularity is attributed to the moderate path it forges between individual zeal and institutional forms. It is the definitive historic piece on formation in community.

Sarpong, P.K. (1989). Spiritual formation and theological education: An African perspective. *Ministerial Formation*, *46*, 3-6.

Asserts the importance of unity of academic training and spiritual formation in the African context, stressing that the leader is often seen as the arbiter and most important person in a community, often as a direct link to deity. The article argues that theological education should prepare leaders for holistic ministry roles and not just bring academic information.

This represents one of the more radical elements of the Ghanaian Catholic tradition, but nonetheless again echoes the need for holistic preparation of leaders.

Schner, George P. (2006). Formation as a unifying concept of theological education. *Theological Education*, 21.2, 94-113.

Senior, Donald and Timothy Weber. (1994). What is the character of curriculum, formation, and cultivation of ministerial leadership in the good theological school? *Theological Education* 30, 2: 17-33.

This report of a diverse ATS task committee explores the question of what constitutes a good curriculum, with particular regard to spiritual formation and the development of ministry skills, in light of cultural changes between the 60's and the mid-90's in the North American context. While it does not provide detailed solutions (because of

the diversity of ATS programmes), the article does helpfully surface the major issues and questions that a school needs to wrestle with, as well as providing some general recommendations.

Smith, G. T. (1996). Spiritual formation in the academy: A unifying model. *Theological Education*, 33, 83-91. [Also available at http://www.iclnet.org/pub/facdialogue/Issue26/Smith.html]

Smith seeks to bring balance to the discussion of the place of spiritual formation in curriculum by arguing that the academic aspects of study should not be set aside or lessened in pursuit of spiritual goals. He argues, instead, that academic study should be infused with an ethos of spiritual formation, seeking to form the mind along with the heart.

This is a useful call toward unity and toward "redeeming" the academic aspect of theological education. There are open places for pursuing how this can happen.

- Smith, G. T. (2007) Theological education and spiritual formation. *The theological educator*, 2.2, 1, 6-7.
- Steele, L.L. (2001). *On the way: A practical theology of Christian formation*. Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock Publishers.

This work seeks to bring together psychological insights as critiqued by Christian theology to describe a practical theology of Christian formation. Steele stresses the "process," emphasizing that there is "no end product." He approaches the topic from an avowedly Arminian standpoint. He critiques Fowler's stages of faith on a number of fronts and seeks to put forward a more evangelical viewpoint. Like many others, he draws heavily on Paulo Freire's conscientization.

This is a compelling work, drawing on the best secular sources and bringing to them a meaningful theological critique from an evangelical perspective. This serves as a useful critique and aid to the use of Fowler's broad theoretical work.

Steubing, R.W. (1998). *Training for godliness in African theological education*. Ndola, Zambia: ACTEA Monographs.

A revised copy of Dr. Steubing's D.Min. thesis at Gordon-Conwell in 1994, this work was published and distributed widely by the Accrediting Council for Theological Education in Africa (ACTEA). Steubing attempts a biblical understanding of spiritual formation based in the Pauline epistles, then surveys the relevant literature on theological education. His final sections survey ways in which spiritual formation is carried out at five seminaries in Ghana, Ethiopia, Nigeria, Kenya and Zambia.

Although much of the anecdotal data is now too dated for meaningful analysis (all five institutions have gone through at least one change of administration since 1994),

many of the focus points remain the same. Steubing underscores the importance of community and active relationships between faculty and students. He also raises the question of differences between residential and non-residential programs. Finally, he calls for more involvement of mature students in the mentoring of younger students, a recommendation that my research has shown to be widely used.

- Stratton, Gary. (2008). Leadership development: fostering a culture of spiritual formation. Workshop given at February 2008 Association for Biblical Higher Education Conference. Available for \$5 as MP3 at http://www.soundword.com/strattongary1.html
- Tenelshof, Judy. (2000). "Spiritual formation: How can Christian education be intentional?" *Christian Education Journal*, 4.2, 111-22.

The author provides a brief and helpful theological underpinning for the seminary's role in spiritual formation, and then describes a model of intentional spiritual formation within a newly refocused curriculum at Talbot School of Theology through a Foundations of Ministry course, mentoring, assessment, and special events.

Thorton, Joyce L. (1998). "Formative Reflection: A step-by-step method for integrating person, theology, and ministry." *Christian Education Journal*, 2.1, 115-27.

The author describes a method of reflection she has developed and uses in the seminary context. The goal of this "Formative Reflection Method" is aimed at "integrating the ministerial person, the bodies of knowledge related to the ministry areas within practical theology, and the practice of ministry." It involves the four steps of: describe, discover, deliberate, and determine.

Warfield, Benjamin B. (n.d.) "The religious life of theological students."

Available online at http://www.tms.edu/tmsj/tmsj6g.pdf. Abridged version available online at http://www.wrs.edu/Materials_for_Web_Site/Journals/8-2%20Aug-2001/Warfield%20-%20Religious%20Life%20of%20Theological%20Students.pdf

- Wilhoit, J. C. and K. O. Gangel. (1998). *The Christian educator's handbook on spiritual formation*. Grand Rapids: Baker Publishing.
- Willard, D. (2000). Spiritual formation in Christ: A perspective on what is and how it might be done. *Journal of Psychology and Theology* 28, 254-58. Available online at http://www.dwillard.org/articles/artview.asp?artID=81
- Willard, D. (2002) Renovation of the heart: Putting on the character of Christ. Colorado Springs: NavPress.

Willard presents a three-stage guide to spiritual formation based on the Great Commission – making apprentices, gathering in Trinitarian community and inner transformation of disciples. Willard focuses on the transformation of the heart and six main aspects of life: thought, feeling, choice, body, social context and soul. The *will* is the key, and life must be organized from the inside. He believes that man, with God's help, can properly organize his life.

Though not as theologically astute as Steele, this is a practically useful guide that I found quite challenging. There is strong focus on human volition and action, although this is appropriately theologically tempered by a focus on continued overtures of God's grace. This is the most practically oriented of the broad works and the most easily applied to everyday life.

Wood, Charles. (1991). "Spiritual formation" and "theological education." *Religious Education* 86 (Fall): 550-56.

Ziegler, Jesse H. (1972). Report of the task force on spiritual development. *Theological Education*, Spring, 153-97.